UNDERSTANDING CULTURAL DIMENSIONS AND VALUE PARADOXES: A META – ANALYSIS

Dr. Gurcharan Singh

Professor School of Management Studies Punjabi University, Patiala guru64@gmail.com

Kanwarvir Singh Khaira

Research Scholar School of Management Studies Punjabi University, Patiala kanwarvirkhaira@gmail.com

ABSTRACT

Viewing to global scenario, India will be among the top five economies in the world by year 2025. As due to increase in Middle class population, cultural dimensions and their core values are rapidly shifting towards westernized culture and individuals are becoming more materialistic. For global marketers, it became very difficult to understand each and every aspect of Indian culture, viewing to large number of sub—cultures and their unique beliefs, attitudes and lifestyles. The purpose of this paper is to get a better understanding of the Indian market looking onto the unique cultural values and then the marketing agencies can formulate a successful strategy accordingly for the targeted market. Meta—Analysis technique was adopted for the paper to analyze 11 studies that examines the different dimensions of both Instrumental and Terminal values.

Keywords: Terminal Values, Instrumental Values, Meta – Analysis, Cross – Cultural marketing.

Introduction:

Ever since the beginning of 21 century, a whole world has become one in terms of segmenting and targeting of market, viewing from marketer point of view. The reason behind that is the technology that is allowing consumers to view each and every aspect on a single click. Moreover, consumption pattern of consumers around the world is somewhat similar; the gap arises due to the cultures and their value system. National culture of any country, as outer stimuli, influence on the diffusion of products across countries (Kumar & Schlegelmilch, 1998). Viewing to globalization, culture had become important issue for the marketers to understand and to further formulate a strategy accordingly.

The paper is confined to Indian culture and their values, which allows Indian nation to be different viewing to other nations on terms of the religion, language, attitudes, beliefs and lifestyle. Viewing to India as a one, the tastes, preferences, choices of individuals within the cultures is heterogeneous in nature. As this further leads to argument that Indian consumer is becoming materialistic (Eng & Bogeart, 2010) and westernized (Batra, Ramaswamy, Alden, Steenkamp, & Ramachander, 2000) with a span of time. In order to understand the Indian consumer, Marketer must try hard to have a clear glimpse of Indian cultural dimensions and unique values, which will resolve their problems in regard to Indian cultural priorities.

(Rokeach, 1973)Stated value as "an enduring belief that one mode of conduct or end – state of existence is preferable to an opposing mode of conduct or end – state of existence". Values

of any country shape its national culture. As culture varies country to country, a close insight about country – specific culture and their values is foremost essential to target the market. In Indian Culture, the values of the extended family are predominant, although individuality is currently developing in Indians, including a large degree of freedom in feeling, thinking and cultivation of one's inner life. There are many different sub – cultures that co – exist in Indian society with their own distinctive values, norms, beliefs and lastly

consumer behaviour. On one hand, India is known for its cultural values, but on other hand the values are too changing comparing to outer world. Considering Rokeach Values, Terminal values differentiate between preferred end states of being whereas instrumental values define the preferred modes of behaviour of means to achieve end states. From paper point of view, 11 studies are included to analyze both terminal and instrumental values. Both the type of values (Instrumental and Terminal) is defined in Table 1 with the examples.

Table 1: Rokeach Values with their definitions

1(a) Terminal Values

Sr. No.	Terminal Values	Definition (Concerned with)	Examples
1	Comfortable Life	Comfort	Prosperous, affluent, well - off
2	Exciting Life	an exciting life	Stimulating, active, thrilling
3	Sense of Accomplishment	accomplishment	Achievement, culmination
4	World at peace	peace	Peaceful, armistice, concord
5	World of beauty	beauty in nature and arts	Charming, splendid, elegant
6	Equality	equality	Equity, impartiality, fairness
7	Family Security	family security	Home, household, stability
8	Freedom	freedom	Free, choice, liberty
9	Happiness	happiness	Happy, content, euphoric
10	Inner Harmony	inner harmony	Balanced, orderly, composure
11	Mature Love	social & spiritual intimacy	Intimacy, sexuality, maturity
12	National Security	safety	Defended, protected, shielded
13	Pleasure	an enjoyable, leisure life	Enjoyment, satisfying
14	Salvation	salvation	Immortality, heaven, delivered
15	Self – Respect	self – esteem	Self – assurance, worthy
16	Social Recognition	respect from others	Admired, accepted, appreciate
17	True Friendship	close companionship	United, fellowship
18	Wisdom	mature understanding	Sense, insight, perceptive

Source: Adopted from a time-based analysis of changing Consumer Values in India, authored by Parthasarathy, Lane, & Stansifer, 2015.

1(b) Instrumental Values

Sr. No.	Instrumental Values	Definition (Concerned with)	Examples
1	Ambition	hard – work	
2	Broadmindedness	open – mindedness	Aspiring, eager, energized
3	Capability	competence	Flexible, tolerant, unprejudiced
4	Cheerfulness	being light-hearted and joyful	Effective, able, proficient
5	Cleanliness	cleanliness	Animated, bright, jovial
6	Courage	standing for one's belief	Neat, tidy, unadulterated
7	Forgiveness	a willingness t	Bold, dauntless, unwavering
8	Helpfulness	a willingness to pardon	Acquit, excuse, overlook
9		working for welfare of others	Assist, support, better
9 Honesty		the truth	True, moral, ethical

Imagination	being daring	
Independence	The state of the s	Creative, original, visionary
THE PARTY OF THE P	AND ADDRESS OF THE PARTY OF THE	Self – sufficient, autonomous
	intellect	Intelligence, reflective, informed
	rationality	Consistent, reasoned, rational
Love	affection	Fond, beloved, caring
Obedience	obedience	Dutiful, observant, yielding
Politeness	courtesy mannerly	Courteousness, civil, proper
Responsibility	being accountable	Reliable, dependable, responsible
Self - Control	self - control	Controlled, perseverant
	Politeness Responsibility	Independence self – reliance Intellect intellect Logic rationality Love affection Obedience obedience Politeness courtesy mannerly Responsibility being accountable

Source: Adopted from Instrumental Values: A five-nation comparative study, authored by Abraham, 1998.

Review of Literature:

Table 2: Meta - Analysis of Rokeach Values

2(a) Terminal Values

						Study					
Value	11	10	9	8	7	6	5	4	3	2	1
COMFORTABLE LIFE					Х				X	Х	
EXCITING LIFE					Х		X		X	X	
SENSE OF ACCOMPLISHMENT	X						Х		X		
WORLD AT PEACE	X			X	X		X			X	X
WORLD OF BEAUTY					X		X			X	X
EQUALITY	X	X			X		X		1/	X	X
FAMILY SECURITY			X		X	X		-	X	X	_ X
FREEDOM	X			X	X			-	X	X	-
HAPPINESS					1			_	X	X	x
INNER HARMONY					X		X		A	A .	^
MATURE LOVE		X	-	1,	X		X		 		
NATIONAL SECURITY	X		-	X	$\frac{\lambda}{x}$		$\frac{x}{x}$		X	X	
PLEASURE		-	-	-	$\frac{\lambda}{x}$	X	<u> </u>			X	
SALVATION	X	-	-	-	X	X				Х	
SELF - RESPECT		-	X	-	$\frac{\lambda}{x}$	X			X	X	X
SOCIAL RECOGNITION		+	+^	-	X	X	X				
TRUE FRIENDSHIP		+	+	_	X				X		
WISDOM		X			,,,						

^{*}X denotes which values are significant in adopted studies

2(b) Instrumental Values

					Study					
		10 9	8	7	6	5	4	3	2	1
Value	11	10 9		X	X		X			
AMBITION	X			X		Х				
BROADMINDEDNESS				X	Х			X	X	
CAPABILITY			3							

				T				Λ		X	
CHEERFULNESS	X				X	X	X		X		
CLEANLINESS			77		X	X	X			X	
COURAGE			X		X	X	X	X			X
FORGIVENESS			X		X	X	X	X			$\frac{\lambda}{\chi}$
HELPFULNESS					X						<u> </u>
HONESTY		X			X		X		X	X	
IMAGINATION					X	X	X		X	X	\overline{X}
INDEPENDENCE	X				X				X		$\frac{\Lambda}{\chi}$
INTELLECT	X							X	X		\ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \ \
LOGIC	X				X						
LOVE	X		X		X			X		X	-
OBEDIENCE				X	X		77			_	X
POLITENESS				X	X		X	X		X	X
RESPOSIBILITY		X	,		X	X			X		X
SELF – CONTROL			X	X	X				X	X	

^{*}X denotes which values are significant in adopted studies

Literature Review is described viewing to Rokeach values i.e., both Terminal Values and Instrumental Values.

Vinson, Munson, & Nakanishi, 1977 in their paper, "An Investigation of Rokeach Value Survey for consumer research applications" discussed the role of personal values in consumer behaviour. Moreover, Rokeach Value Survey was brought into regard in order to enhance the desired end states of existence and preferable modes of conduct. Factor analysis with varimax rotation derived six – factors for terminal values and four – factors for instrumental values. Study distinguished among group of people on behalf of instrumental and terminal values, provides implications for marketing and consumer behaviour researchers.

Hofstede & Bond, 1984 in their paper, "Hofstede's cultural dimensions: An independent validation using Rokeach Value Survey" investigated of emic research i.e. to understand a culture from the inside. Factor Analysis technique was brought into consideration to associate Hofstede's cultural dimensions with the Rokeach values. Study explored the scoring method of Rokeach value survey from ranking to rating, the tendency to score all value items as more or as less important. The Synergy of both Hofstede's culture dimensions and Rokeach values allows to dig the cross — cultural gaps more significantly and furthermore, to implement strategy accordingly.

Munson & McQuarrie, 1988 in their paper, "Shortening the Rokeach Value Survey for use in consumer research" examined the shortening of 36 Rokeach values to a set of more consumption relevant values. The concept of values instrumentality approach was brought in use to identify those values which can be linked to product attributes, but aren't necessarily global human values. 12 – Values like world at peace, mature love, forgiving, honest etc, was discarded which have nothing to do with consumer research; the study was highly useful in formulating product positioning and advertising strategies.

Abraham, 1998 in her paper, "Instrumental values: A five-nation Comparative study" explores the relation in between the 18 – instrumental values in context of Individualism and Collectivism. Principal Component's factor analysis followed by varimax rotation was used to extract four factors explaining 55% of the variance. Analysis of the results showed different value interest among the five – different nations with different beliefs, attitude, wants and desires.

Debats & Bartelds, 2000 in their paper, "The structure of human values: A principal component analysis of the Rokeach value survey" assessed the both terminal and instrumental values by means of Principal Component analysis followed by varimax rotation. The study explored the single items of Rokeach value survey as beyond to a multiple – item assessment of the value concept. Furthermore, results were compared to check the internal reliability for the identical sub—scales and too for major ones.

Banerjee, 2008 in her paper, "Dimensions of Indian culture, core cultural values and Marketing Implications" laid down the implications with aspect to the verbal model of cultural and value dimensions of Indian consumers. The Model has two dimensions: Culture and Value. With regard to this model, various advertising campaigns were set up as assessing to the heterogeneity behaviour of the Indian consumer co – existing in Indian society with their own distinctive values and beliefs.

Koivula, 2008 in her paper, "Basic human values in the workplace" mentioned various value theories in order to explore significant cultural variations with different value priorities. The study examined of the seven factors in values with relating to Rokeach values – (1) Immediate gratification vs. Delayed gratification (2) Competence vs. Religion (3) Self – Constriction vs. Self – Expansion (4) Social orientation vs. Personal orientation (5) Societal security vs. Family security (6) Respect vs. Love and, lastly (7) Inner – directed vs. Other directed. Moreover, Rokeach value survey has been

considered biased towards western values and limited too in the number of dimensions assessed.

Jung, Polyorat, & Kellaris, 2009 in their paper, "A cultural paradox in authority - based advertising" focussed on explaining the value paradoxes with regard to the advertising appeals. The study showed the perception of the people inside a given nation and allowing them to understand the world in a different way as from outside the culture. It appeared that a shift away from traditional cultural values has been occurring with a course of modernization, as more westernized culture is being adopted in eastern countries too.

Boachie-Mensah & Boohene, 2012 in their paper, "A Review of Cross - Cultural variations in Consumer Behaviour and Marketing Strategy" discussed how the cultural values lead towards the consumption pattern. Cultural values affect behaviour through norms, which further allows to stimuli response to specific kind of situation. The study developed various major questions that shall be focussed on, in order to formulate a cross - cultural marketing strategy.

Anderson, 2012 in his paper, "Indian cultural values and Economic Development: an exploratory study" analyzed relation between the Porter's diamond model components and cultural values. Various cultural aspects came forward with regard to Indian students who tend to exhibit greater conformity, emotional self - control and collectivism values, while Asian - American students tend to place higher preference towards family recognition. Study explored the relationship of values to sustainable economic development.

Parthasarathy, Lane, & Stansifer, 2015 in their paper, "A time based analysis of changing consumer values in India" discussed the change in values of youth Indian consumer within a time span of ten years i.e., from 2004 - 2014. Authors illustrated the change in different Rokeach values over a period of time and Indian youth becoming increasingly materialistic, more westernized and more favourably disposed to global brands. Hofstede's cultural - dimensions outlined the

concept of value - system and their changing consumption patterns with a span of time.

Research Gap:

While reviewing the 11 studies included in literature review, it was reviewed that very few studies have been found relating to understand the Indian cultural dimensions and value system. Most surveys conducted are confined to western background, lacks questions and formulation of strategies relating to Asian values. To understand Indian cultural dimensions and value paradoxes, this study (research) was brought into consideration.

Objective of the study:

To examine both Terminal and Instrumental values in Indian context.

Research Methodology:

Research Design;

The Research design of study is Descriptive cum Analytical in nature. The research is based on processed data. The data was collected from Journals like -Journal of International Marketing Review, Journal of Technology Management, and Cross Cultural Management: An International Journal, Journal of Indian Business Research etc. Those papers were adopted that were relating to Rokeach values.

b) Statistical Technique;

Meta - Analysis technique was considered for the following paper and was analysed using the Comprehensive Meta Analysis tool. Comprehensive Meta Analysis program is most widely used to explain the process of Meta-Analysis. Under analysis, the goal of synthesis is to understand the results of any study in the context of all the other studies. Focus is on the data analysis rather than the full process of the review.

Data Analysis and Results:

Table 3: Fixed-Effect versus Random-Effects Models for Binary Data

Model	Study name			Statistics for each study					Events / Total		Std diff in means and 95% CI				
		Std diff in means	Standard	Variance	Lower limit	Upper limit	Z-Value	pValue	Terminal	Instrumental	-1.00	4.50	0.00	0.50	1.00
	\6-co et et		0.383	0.147	-0.885	0.619	-0.347	0.729	6/18	7/18	-	_	- -	+	
	Vinson et al.	u 135 0.505	0.380	0.144	-0.240	1.250	1.329	0.184	12/18	8/18			_	_	
	Hofstede	0.246	0.370	0.137	0.479	0.971	0.665	0.506	10/18	8/18					
	Munson	-1.755	0.831	0.691	-3.385	-0.126	-2111	0.035	0/18	7/18			-		-
	Abraham, Debats and	0.123	0.369	0.136	-0.600	0.846	0.334	0.739	9/18	8/18		+		\rightarrow	-
		1,404	0.391	0.153	-1.169	0.362	-1.034	0.301	5/18	8/18		- •		-	
	Banerjee, Koivula,	0.416	0.702	0.493	-1.791	0.960	-0.592	0.554	16/18	17/18					
	Jung et al.	0.000	0.493	0.243	-0.967	0.967	0.000	1.000	3/18	3/18					-
	Mensah	-0.456	0.518	0.269	-1.472	0.560	0.879	0.379	2/18	4/18		+	_	_	
	Anderson,	0.259	0.541	0.293	-0.801	1.319	0.479	0.632	3/18	2/18	-	_		\vdash	$\overline{}$
	Parthasarat	0.000	0.390	0.152	-0.764	0.764	0.000	1.000	6/18	6/18		_	_	_	-
Fixed	. Grande	-0.027	0.133	0.018	-0.289	0.234	0.205	0.837				-	+		
Random		0.027	0.133	0.018	-0.289	0.234	-0.205	0.837					+		

Summary data is based on a binary outcome such as events and non events in two groups, the appropriate effect size will usually be the risk ratio, the odds ratio or the risk difference. Considering the 11 studies included for the analysis, only one study was statistically significant, while the other ten were not, which led to conclude that there was evidence against an effect, or that the results were inconsistent. While, one may assume that 10 studies failed to reach statistical significance because they reported small effects. On the other hand, as there are only very few studies considered for the Meta Analysis, so in this regard the estimate of the between studies variance will have poor precision, lacks information needed to apply it correctly. In this aspect, one might choose among several options.

- i. One option is to report the separate effects and not report a summary effect.
- ii. Another option is to perform a fixed-random effect analysis as shown in Table 3. This approach would yield a descriptive analysis of the included studies, but would not allow us to make inferences about a wider population.
- iii. A third option is to take a Bayesian Approach, where the estimates of TAU squared is based on a data from outside of the current set of studies.

Power Analysis

Power Analysis is performed when the review is being planned and not after the review has been completed. Many studies in medicine, psychology and education have power substantially lower than 80% to detect large effects, and substantially lower than 50% to detect smaller effects that are still important enough to be of theoretical and practical importance (Borenstein, Hedges, Higgins, & Rothstein, 2009). The test of a moderator variable in a Meta Analysis is akin to the test of an interaction in a primary study, and suffers from the same factors that tend to decrease power. First, the effect size is actually the difference between the two effect sizes and so is almost invariably smaller than the main effect size. Second. the sample size within groups is smaller in for both Terminal and Instrumental values. Therefore, power for testing the moderator will often be very low (Hedges & Pigott, 2004). The fact of lower power for tests of the effects of covariates is especially important because these kinds of analysis are often carried out in order to demonstrate that the moderator variables don't have an effect i.e., to accept the null hypothesis.

Table 4: Forest Plot

Model	Study name	Event	s / Total		Correlation and 95% CI						
		Terminal	Instrumental	-1.00	-0.50	0.00	0.50	1.00			
	Vinson et.al,	6/18	7/18	1 .	I —		_ 1	1			
	Hofstede	12/18	8/18								
	Munson	10/18	8/18								
	Abraham,	0/18	7/18	_							
	Debats and	9/18	8/18								
	Banerjee,	5/18	8/18				_				
	Koivula,	16/18	17/18								
	Jung et.al,	3/18	3/18								
	Mensah	2/18	4/18								
	Anderson,	3/18	2/18			•	.				
	Parthasarat	6/18	6/18			•					
Fixed			- · · ·	- 1			— I				
Random				- 1	- 1		- 1				

In the Forest Plot, each study as well as the summary effect is depicted as a point estimate bounded by its confidence interval. When studies report data as correlations, usually use the correlation coefficient itself as the effect size, transform the correlation using the Fisher's z-transformation and perform the analysis using the index. Reviewing the Table 4, only one study was significant i.e. - Banerjee, 2008, as the effect size for the particular study is large, defining Rokeach values with relate to Indian context. Both Instrumental and Terminal values are analyzed as accordance to literature review in Indian scenario,

Firstly, viewing to the Terminal values, Indians show very least interest towards following values – world at peace, world of beauty and national security. It dictates that the people in India push – on their ideas, beliefs and thoughts from one generation to another, and try to be fixed to their root values. This implies that individuals in India, on one hand are not at all concerned with world at war or peace; rather they are busy with their own work (Banerjee, 2008). Furthermore on other hand, joint families are shifting towards nuclear families. This indicates that the values like family security;

mature love, salvation, equality and social recognition are decreasing and increase of following terminal values - freedom and pleasure. Respect for elders and parents are continually decreasing as individuals are becoming more materialistic and self – independent.

Coming onto the Instrumental values, collectivistic countries like India are based on strict hierarchical differentiation with powerful and autocratic leadership. This indicates that nation like India are more devoted towards ambition, love, independence and intellectualism values (Parthasarathy, Lane, & Stansifer, 2015) and hence, more Instrumental values have became insignificant with span of time cheerfulness, forgiveness, helpfulness and politeness values (Abraham, 1998). However, competitive individualism is severely frowned on in Indian society because it can break old traditions and disrupt relationships, but youth doesn't bother about it anymore. Moreover, Indian youth is the one which are

rapidly changing their values as viewing from globalization point of view and mostly adopting to westernized culture. So, too traditional values like loyalty and obedience are decreasing (Jung, Polyorat, & Kellaris, 2009).

Value Paradox

"Value Paradox" is a name regard to process in which final behaviour of an individual is different of what is desired, on behalf of culture. According to (Mooij, 1998), a value paradox occurs in relate to the difference between the desirable values and desired values. The desired values leads to distinction among individuals on their thinking behaviour whereas, desirable values are termed right or wrong with relate to society. The desired relates to priority, to what is important and needed at once. The desirable relates to approval and disapproval, referring to people at glance. The difference between two is stated in Table 5.

Table 5: The Desired values versus The Desirable values

The Desired	The Desirable
The Desired	The norm, what ought
What people want for their own	Approval or disapproval
• Choice	What is wrong and other way around
Prioritizing	Refer to people in general
Relate to "Me" and "You"	• Ideology
Pragmatism	- Ideology

Source: Adopted from Global Marketing and Advertising, authored by Mooij, 2014.

The both 'desired' and 'desirable' can be determined on behalf of Indian culture as what are the practices in the particular nation to the unique specific values in that culture. Concept of value paradox is empirically supported by (House, Hanges, Javidan, Dorfman, & Gupta, 2004) that the countries like India, having high score on power distance dimension, will likely have paradox in terms of 'value'. Viewing to advertising appeals in India, the advertisements contain values relating to Feminity and high uncertainty avoidance (Parthasarathy, Lane, & Stansifer, 2015). Moreover, India is still a society with clear collectivistic traits, as different groups across nation have somewhat similar patterns of living. Furthermore, to have an effective winning strategy, marketers and their agencies should focus on what Indian consumer wants and mere need to identify gap between the desired and desirable values.

Implications:

Marketers can bring into existence the 'One or Different Brand Names, One advertising form, Different Executions' Strategy to target Indian culture. It implies that looking onto the one form, different ads can be developed for particular country, and moreover execution reflects specific values. For e.g. - Big brand - name like P&G make use of the particular strategy to target Indian market and even are successful too. P&G advertise similar forms of products with different

brand names, using either one basic form of advertising (like - lesson or drama), and side - by - side adapt to cultural values also.

Secondly, 'Cultural Segmentation: Act Global, Think Local' Strategy can too be brought into use viewing from marketing agencies viewpoint. It states that companies can get benefits of globalization in production, labour, distribution etc, and moreover can build good relations with local customers and employees. Revolving around the Indian culture, advertising style may vary in accordance to languages, religions and value - systems, so advertisers shall make ad - campaigns accordingly.

References:

- Abraham, R. (1998). Instrumental Values: A five-nation comparative study. Cross-Cultural Management: An International Journal, 5-21.
- Anderson, B. B. (2012). Indian Cultural Values and Economic Development: An exploratory Study. World Journal of Entrepreneurship, Management and Sustainable Development, 194-201.
- Banerjee, S. (2008). Dimensions of Indian Culture, core cultural values and marketing implications. Cross Cultural Management: An International Journal, 367-378.

- Batra, Ramaswamy, R., Alden, Steenkamp, D. L., & Ramachander, S. (2000). Effects of brand local and nonlocal origin on consumer attitudes in developing countries. *Journal of Consumer Psychology*, 83-95.
- Boachie-Mensah, F. O., & Boohene, R. (2012). A review of Cross-Cultural variations in consumer behaviour and marketing strategy. *International Business and Management*, 122-129.
- Borenstein, M., Hedges, L. V., Higgins, J. P., & Rothstein, H. R. (2009). Introduction to Meta-Analysis. John Wiley & Sons Ltd.
- Debats, & Bartelds. (2000). The structure of Human Values: A principal component analysis of the Rokeach Value Survey. Retrieved June 21, 2016, from Shodhganga: http://www.ub.rug.nl/eldoc/dis/ppsw/d.l.h.m.debats/thesis.pdf
- Eng, & Bogeart. (2010). Psychological and cultural insights into consumption of luxury brands in India. *Journal of Customer Behaviour*, 55-75.
- Hedges, & Pigott. (2004). The power of statistical tests for moderators in Meta-Analysis. Psychological Methods, 426-445.
- Hofstede, G., & Bond, M. H. (1984). Hofstede's cultural dimensions: An independent validation using Rokeach's Value Survey. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, 417-433.
- House, Hanges, Javidan, Dorfman, & Gupta. (2004). Culture, Leadership and Organizations: The Globe study of 62 Societies. California: Sage Publications.

- Jung, J. M., Polyorat, K., & Kellaris, J. J. (2009). A cultural paradox in authority-based advertising. International Marketing Review, 601-632.
- Koivula, N. (2008). Basic Human Values in the workplace. Journal of Applied Social Psychology, 1263-1273.
- Kumar, V. J., & Schlegelmilch, B. B. (1998). Cross-National diffusion research: what do we know and how certain we are? Journal of Product Innovation Management, 255-268.
- Mooij, M. d. (1998). Global Marketing and Advertising: Understanding Cultural Paradoxes. Netherland: Sage Publications, First Edition.
- Mooij, M. d. (2014). Global Marketing and Advertising: Understanding Cultural Paradoxes. Netherland: Sage Publications, Fourth Edition.
- Munson, J. M., & McQuarrie, E. F. (1988). Shortening the Rokeach Value Survey for use in Consumer Research. Advances in Consumer Research, 381-386.
- Parthasarathy, M., Lane, V., & Stansifer, M. L. (2015). A time-based analysis of changing consumer values in India. *Journal of Indian Business Research*, 271-291.
- Rokeach, M. (1973). The nature of Human Values. New York: The Free Press.
- Vinson, D. E., Munson, J. M., & Nakanishi, M. (1977). An Investigation of the Rokeach Value Survey for consumer research applications. Advances in Consumer Research, 247-252.